2012-2013

Supervisor Training Workgroup Report

Rob Kerner, *UC Davis*

Greta Carl-Halle, *UC Santa Barbara*

Maty Corral-Avila*, UC Berkeley*

Stephanie Fix, *UC Irvine*

Michael Luttrell, *UC Santa Cruz*

Tanya Williams*, UC Los Angeles*

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

The University of California has long relied on its staff for operational excellence in order to fulfill its mission. The staff at UC are dedicated employees and, as such, the organization needs to recognize the importance of supervision as an integral part of the success of the individual employee, the unit the employee works in, and the University as a whole. The ability to properly supervise staff is a critical component of that success. Properly trained supervisors will help us achieve that goal.

The 2012-2013 CUCSA Supervisor Training workgroup focused on different areas that involve supervision. We first sought out to analyze the supervisor training programs that each UC operates. In doing so, we found many different programs which may or may not be cultivating excellent supervisors. We also found few programs that were mandatory. Second, we looked at advanced supervisor training. We found that there are a few system wide programs as well as a few local programs, but overall there does not seem to be a well-organized effort to advance our staff to the next level of their career. We found many times there is a "glass ceiling" to move into higher level management positions. We feel changes are necessary in these areas that will both improve the work environment of the staff as well as the job satisfaction of the supervisor. These changes can create a work atmosphere of mutual respect and lead to an improvement in staff morale.

After reviewing our research from our own UC institutions, as well as training offerings at comparable public and private institutions, CUCSA suggests that we make the following changes to supervisor training programs:

- Consider mandatory supervisor training for all new-to-role supervisors, including faculty that supervise staff;
- Provide supervisors who are also functional employees with reasonable time to fulfill their supervisory responsibilities in addition to their day-to-day workload;
- Consider mandatory continuing education courses for experienced supervisors;
- Develop a coordinated advanced managerial training program to assist current staff who wish to move into future management and leadership roles at UC; and
- Ensure at the system level that each UC is adequately funding training to meet these minimum standards.

These changes will significantly affect the workplace in a positive way. Well-trained and engaged supervisors will not only improve staff in their own unit, but will be able to attract new staff that will make UC more effective in teaching and research. Better training means better staff and better satisfied stakeholders.

Background

The University of California system includes the UC Office of the President (UCOP), nine general campuses, three national laboratories, and five medical centers. For the purposes of this report we focused on the general campuses and UCOP. Each location we looked at offers supervisor training, however each develops and delivers training in-house with minimal cross-collaboration among the campuses.

One marker for the University of California's future success is the quality and effectiveness of campus supervisors and managers. Under the guise of becoming operationally more effective, some supervisors are stepping into leadership roles for the first time with minimal (if any) supervisory/managerial experience. It is important for these new supervisors, as well as existing long-time supervisors, to learn and expand key competencies in order to excel and move forward in their careers.

Objective

Our objective was to take a comprehensive look at the supervisor training being conducted, developed and offered across the entire UC system. The results of this report will inform and provide guidance on how to effectively offer system-wide training programs for supervisors, while still maintaining core, campus-specific supervisory training classes.

Project Scope

This CUCSA workgroup project launched in September 2012 and concluded in June 2013. In the original project charter, the scope of this project was to investigate, report our findings, and make recommendations on different areas that involve supervision, in order to produce a report that would:

1. Provide a snapshot of supervisory training conducted at various UC campuses,
2. Review what offerings are available at other comparable higher-education institutions, and
3. Evaluate training status, identify gaps, and make recommendations to the CUCSA delegation and the Office of the President.

As the project unfolded, it became clear that we not only had to address the supervisory training or lack-there-of, but also the barriers staff face when they want to advance in their careers. Having a cohesive, well-funded succession plan for existing staff is critical to the University's overall operational excellence. Supervisor training is a key component of succession planning and, as such, was also looked at in the context of professional development and career advancement.

Methodology

In order to research the extent of supervisor training at our campuses, the workgroup focused on career development and the training offered at each campus and UCOP. We also researched comparable non-UC system peer institutions. In addition, we did substantial online research, made many direct calls, and responded to feedback received from our peers at the quarterly CUCSA meetings. Those meetings also afforded the workgroup time to continue to brainstorm and work on substantiating report findings.

Each location we examined offers some kind of supervisor training, however each campus develops and delivers the training differently and offers a variety of different classes.

For our research, we surveyed the locations and asked ten questions related to supervisor training.

The questions were as follows:

1. Is supervisor training required to become a supervisor?
2. What types of supervisor training are available?
3. Are there restrictions on who can take supervisor training?
4. Are there time restrictions on completing the training?
5. Are there refresher courses for long time supervisors?
6. Are there advanced courses?
7. Who pays for the training courses?
8. How frequently are classes offered?
9. Is a supervisor's performance linked to supervisory training?
10. Are courses online or in a classroom or a hybrid?

To find the answers to these questions, we researched the University's campus human resources, training and development websites, and conducted phone and face-to-face interviews with human resources staff.

Our research involved comparing the schools to see similarities in courses being offered and looked at commonalities and differences among the schools. We also looked at other non-UC universities to see what type of supervisor training they offered. We found that there was a lack of consistency across the UC system. Some locations had extensive training programs, while others were lacking. We looked at existing supervisor training programs and, based on what was offered at the majority of UC locations and industry best practices, we started to gather a listing of courses that should be a required component of mandatory supervisor training.

Mandatory Minimum Standards

UC should have a minimum, mandatory, standardized training curriculum for all supervisors or potential supervisors. The instructional areas need to include: talent management and recruitment; performance management; communication and delegation; policies and processes; diversity and inclusion; and conflict management. This training should not be limited to staff supervising staff but should also include faculty who supervise staff, and courses should be open to prospective supervisors, too.

Talent Management and Recruitment

Every supervisor should be able to effectively recruit and hire staff based on federal and state regulations, as well as UC policies, to conduct consistent, legal, and fair hiring processes. These regulations incorporate all stages of the full-cycle recruitment process, i.e., creating proper job descriptions; applying principles of inclusion; managing special placement candidates and medical separation applicants; and selecting applicants based on qualifications defined for the position. In order to keep staff engaged, supervisors also need to be able to manage the talent of their employees.

Supervisors must create and maintain an employee's desire to stay at UC, especially if that employee excels. Supervisors must have the ability to identify employees that are capable of moving upward and being developed. Supervisors also need to have an understanding of different programs available at UC that focus on developing top employees. Supervisors with a working knowledge of talent management and recruitment will allow UC to both hire new, talented employees and identify existing employees with strong aptitudes.

Performance Management

Effective performance management by supervisors is paramount in the development of current employees. A supervisor that fully understands performance management and how to implement it for their employees will have a better and more engaged staff. A supervisor needs to be trained and informed on understanding departmental and campus goals, promoting consistency in performance assessment, motivating all employees to perform at their best, and conducting their jobs with fairness and transparency. This training should also include constant performance planning, assessment, coaching, and development of the employee. Supervisors are responsible for developing performance expectations with the participation of employees. Employee and supervisor must communicate throughout the performance management cycle about the employees' goals, performance, and development. The supervisor needs to recognize employees' successful performance, as well as coach them towards possible improvements, if needed. The supervisor must also ensure that employees have the tools, resources, and

training and development needed to carry out their duties successfully. Additionally, supervisors need to know how they can reward their employees using different avenues within the UC system (including non-monetary rewards and recognition), as well as positively guide their employees towards successfully advancing their careers. Unfortunately, not all supervisors actively pursue these goals as they have limited time and resources to focus on their employees' job as well as their own. UC, therefore, needs to both train its supervisors on performance management and allot those supervisors ample time to manage their workloads.

Communication and Delegation

Communication and delegation are important components that a supervisor needs to develop in order to lead effectively. Great communication and delegation skills are integral in keeping working relationships positive and moving forward. Without communication and proper delegation of tasks, employees get frustrated and become disengaged, therefore increasing their desire to resign. UC needs to train supervisors on proper communication to strengthen the supervisor/supervisee bond and keep employees fully engaged. Similarly, delegation skills are valuable. Employees want to feel their work has meaning and is important, and is not just busy work that their supervisor does not want to do. Training supervisors to practice strong communication and delegation skills will make UC employees happier and more engaged in their work.

Employment Policies and Process Maps

Many employees are placed in the supervisory role because of their technical skills, not because they actually have the skill set required to supervise. In cases like these, the misplaced staff members do not understand their role as a supervisor nor the concurrent duties that are assigned to them. Supervisors must be trained on the basic policies and procedures of the University before employee supervision can even begin. This includes, but is not limited to: basic campus information; basic job information of their employees; office culture and etiquette; job safety; approval of time records and requests for time off; and employee discipline and reward practices.

Diversity and Inclusion

Diversity nurtures strength in the workplace and focuses on respect for all human differences including age, culture, ethnicity, race, national origin, language, gender, socioeconomic status, educational background, religion, sexual orientation, and physical ability.[1] Diversity is valued for bringing a balance in perspective, talent, skill, and strengths to the workplace. Understanding and embracing contributions from staff that are of different backgrounds and ideologies is of vital importance to UC. Maintaining excellence through diversity requires developing an environment free from discrimination and harassment and a workforce equipped

with culturally competent skills. Diverse staff can provide high quality levels of service to meet the needs of our changing student population. Staff with diverse backgrounds can also bring a different perspective to ideas and solutions. People want to feel valued and included. When commitment and productivity are lost, because staff members feel disregarded, time is wasted with conflicts and misunderstandings. Therefore, diversity and inclusion training should be mandatory for all UC staff supervisors.

Conflict management

Conflict is often unavoidable in work groups because of differences in goals and personal styles. Supervisors need to be trained on how to help employees address and resolve a wide array of concerns and complaints. Such discontent typically involves job duties and descriptions, performance standards, and relationships with coworkers, supervisors and managers. Conflict management training will allow supervisors to assist their employees in effectively managing grievances and dissatisfaction in the workplace.

Business Case for Mandatory Supervisor Training

According to *Training* magazine's survey of the world's top 125 training organizations, successful companies view training as a financial investment, not as a business luxury. [2] Training programs support specific business initiatives including: cost savings, reducing turnover, creating organizational efficiencies, increasing revenues, and improving service quality. At UC this translates to better supported faculty and students. A well-trained supervisor will significantly impact the mission of UC.

Our recommendations for mandatory supervisor training directly align with several of UC's business goals:

<u>Increased productivity</u>

In an era where university staff are constantly being asked to do more with fewer resources, providing training for supervisors on skills such as teamwork, time management, and project management will become essential for our future leaders. Supervisors will need to have the critical thinking skills necessary to develop ways of increasing productivity without adding staff or increasing costs. Training in these areas will also lead to fewer mistakes, greater consistency in managing complex projects and less "reinventing of the wheel." A recent Gallup poll also determined that "poorly managed work groups are on average 50 percent less productive and 44 percent less profitable than well-managed groups." [3]

Increased Performance

High performing supervisors tend to create higher performing staff. The more productive and effective the team is, the better the results will be for the campus.

Happier, More Engaged Staff

Teaching managers to become more supportive of their direct reports can be a simple way to improve employee satisfaction and engagement. According to a Harvard Business Review study, "employees of trained supervisors were more satisfied in their jobs than a control group of workers whose managers did not undergo training." [4] Engaged staff tend to feel a sense of pride, fulfillment, and empowerment. Training also leads to increased staff retention and makes it easier to attract and recruit new talent.

Succession Planning

Due to the retirements of baby boomers, institutional knowledge is being lost. There is now a greater need to invest in training for the next generation of UC leaders. Supervisor training can contribute to succession planning by nurturing the skills and abilities of future managers and leaders. This can also reduce the costs of having to hire externally to replace retiring staff, as it is typically more cost effective to recruit an internal candidate for a leadership position.

Reduced Costs: Health Related Issues

According to a study from the National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health, "77% of employees who have bad managers experience physical symptoms from stress such as heart problems. Stressed employees cost employers nearly twice as much in health-care costs — roughly $600 more per person per year, on average." [5] Supervisors who are trained to manage the work/life issues of their employees can learn to recognize when someone is experiencing stress and recommend ways to reduce it before it becomes a physical issue leading to increased costs and absenteeism.

Reduced turnover

A Gallup poll of the U.S. working population concluded that 16.5% of respondents said they voluntarily left their company because of management or the general work environment. [6] Trained supervisors who understand how to manage and support their direct reports can lead to a reduction in turnover, resulting in less cost to replace staff. Thirty case studies taken from the 11 most-relevant research papers on the costs of employee turnover demonstrate that it costs businesses about one-fifth of a worker's salary to replace that worker.[7] For businesses that experience high levels of turnover, this can represent significant costs. Better training of supervisors will realize cost savings.

<u>Working Smarter Initiative</u>

With the current fiscal crisis in place, UC has been required to reduce spending without compromising quality. Creating a centrally funded supervisor training program would allow more staff to be properly trained. While we do not think the program should be run through UCOP, best practices should be developed and shared throughout the system. Central funding provides the necessary fiscal support to ensure action on the campuses.

<u>Improved Career Prospects</u>

Effective supervisor training can lead to promotions into future leadership positions within the University. Career management has been identified at many of the UC's as an area that is visibly lacking. The advanced training discussed would allow staff to better utilize the existing resources to assist them in career management. In addition, it can motivate a staff member to move up into a management role. With a required supervisor training program in place, staff will have opportunities to network, learn from others, and advance in their career.

<u>Competitive Advantage</u>

Having a customized supervisor training program will give UC an advantage in the marketplace. With increasing competition to attract non-resident students, UC will constantly need to manage change. Our current ways of doing business are becoming obsolete in this changing environment and supervisors will need to come up with different ways of thinking in order to maintain a competitive advantage.

<u>Develop skills</u>

Training programs build on existing skills and knowledge. They can also close any knowledge gaps and build on transferable skills. Continued supervisor training will equip people to deal with specific tasks and challenges, as well as broaden areas of expertise and competence. Courses will continually update and refresh best practice knowledge and technical skills.

Findings

All UC campuses and UCOP have some level of supervisory training available to staff. Classes are taught in a number of subject areas such as: hiring practices; employee performance management; policies and procedures; employee and labor relations; employee selection; and employee promotion. The training available varies by campus location, funding source, and training delivery methods.

UCOP offers system-wide training programs that target executive and leadership levels. The most visible system-wide programs are the Management Development Program (MDP), the Business Officer Institute (BOI), the Management Skills Assessment Program (MSAP) and Sexual Harassment prevention training. Of these programs, only the Sexual Harassment prevention training is mandatory for supervisors across all the campuses (pursuant to California state law AB1825).

Findings across the UC system indicate that only UC Davis has mandatory training for new-to-role supervisors. Also among our findings is that the majority of existing staff supervisors are functional employees with often heavy workloads, in addition to their supervisory responsibilities. Training of these supervisors will not only assist them in fulfilling their job duties as a supervisor, it should also serve as a way to ensure they are given the appropriate time to supervise their staff. Good supervision takes time and effort, and if one piece is missing it becomes extremely difficult to be a good supervisor.

Most of the trainings offered have been developed at the individual campus level with no comprehensive, system-wide financial support. Each campus uses resources and budget allocations differently for supervisor training programs. Some campuses allocate a larger percentage of funds for staff professional development (which includes supervisor staff training) than others. We found little, if any, system-wide financial support for the development and delivery of training specific to *new to role* supervisors. As part of a risk prevention program (and perhaps with risk prevention funding), UCOP needs to ensure that each campus adequately invests in supervisor training curriculum for both new to role supervisors and advanced supervisors. Creating a mandatory supervisor training program without adequately funding it would set the program up to fail. It would also continue the inequity some UC campuses have over those that choose to invest more heavily in training.

Advanced Supervisor Training

Supervisor training should not be seen as something that comes only at the beginning of a supervisor's career. It is important that long time supervisors participate in training, not only as a refresher, but also to adapt to our ever-changing institution. With the introduction of shared service centers and new technologies, the workplace at UC has changed drastically, and it will continue to change as we adjust the way we do business in our fluctuating economic climate. Supervisors must learn to adjust the way they lead their employees and the types of expectations they set for individuals. Learning how to function and keeping staff motivated in a constantly shifting workplace are important.

While the training of a new supervisor provides the basic skills to lead a team, advanced training should hone leadership skills so that a supervisor can serve as a mentor and create high performing teams. It is in this advanced training that a supervisor will learn the difference between management, which is about process, and leadership, which is about behavior. Advanced training in change management should focus on strategic planning and helping supervisors identify opportunities to capitalize on the strengths and weakness of their teams, while at the same time, maintaining a sense of stability and security. This higher level of training should also address the necessity of taking risks to initiate change and to maximize opportunities. A strong leader will inspire and motivate their staff. By establishing a healthy environment in the workplace, they keep staff engaged and productive. Supervisors then go beyond being a manager and will develop the confidence of their staff so that they can influence staff in constructive ways and foster collaboration. An experienced supervisor will influence opinions because the staff value and believe in them as a leader. They are followed because people trust and respect them. Understanding the necessity of having a clear vision is essential for a seasoned supervisor, and developing self-efficacy is crucial.

The advanced supervisor should be trained in performance management so that they can learn to identify the strengths of talented staff and the weaknesses that need attention. This is important for operational effectiveness. By setting clear and concise goals, a supervisor can ensure the department runs optimally and effectively. An important part of this is learning effective coaching. A supervisor should know how to hold employees accountable for their responsibilities. They should inspire their employees to reach their potential and challenge them to grow. Supervisors can then provide positive support, feedback and advice to improve personal effectiveness. It is important to align the employees' needs and the aims of the organization.

Career management is an important skill on which advanced supervisor training should focus. An advanced supervisor will develop one's self as well as their staff. This is a key factor of succession planning.   Personal fulfillment is also important in career management.   Every staff member needs to achieve a work/life balance. A supervisor is integral in helping their staff achieve a balance while keeping their department functioning. Training, like all other staff duties, needs to become engrained in staff. They need to feel that the training is part of their job, and not have to double their workload before and after training sessions. It needs to become more integrated in the supervisor evaluation process.

The development of high potential employees is important. Those who have the skills and knowledge should be nurtured to continue to lead within UC. An experienced supervisor should provide skills to help staff develop in their careers, and needs to know how to help staff identify the tools they need to grow and develop so that they can achieve their career goals.

Supervising, like any other position, requires fine tuning the skills needed to be successful at the job. If a supervisor remains stagnant while the workplace changes around them, they will find themselves left behind. Tools that work today may not work in the future in effectively leading a team. For this reason, we suggest a supervisor be required to complete 16 hours of continuing education training every year.

We found no formal continuing education requirements for experienced supervisors. There is no link between performance evaluations of supervisory personnel and any kind of training or continuing education. Staff supervisors are not currently taking advantage of excellent training programs available on campuses. There are no incentives in place for them to willingly enroll and complete what few programs are offered. Additionally there is little time for them to take classes. UC needs to make advanced supervisor training a priority. UC wide courses need to be better coordinated with campus offering, and leadership training needs to be expanded.

Measuring Success

UC already has invested in the UC Learning Center. This tool should be leveraged for online training, as well as for measuring the progress of staff and training. However, the tool only tracks one small part of supervisor training, which is course fulfillment. In addition to designing excellent training, we also need to invest in follow-up investigation to ensure the training is both improving supervisors and the working environment.

Measurement of supervisory training programs will be crucial to implementation and success. Donald L. Kirkpatrick developed an evaluation model for training and development over 40 years ago. [8] His model has been the most widely used evaluation model in the field of workplace learning and performance. Based on his model, there are several ways to measure the success of a supervisor training program:

Level 1 – Reaction: How did UC supervisors like the training provided? This can be measured by sending out a post- training survey to include questions such as:

1. What did you like/dislike about the training?
2. What is your opinion of the training?
3. What new information did you learn from the training?
4. What did you learn from the training that can be immediately applied in the workplace?
5. Did the training meet your expectations? Why/why not?
6. Would you recommend this session to your peers/staff/other?

Level 2 – Learning: Measure learning pre- and post-training. This can be done via a short quiz to participants before the training that asks them to answer questions related to the course material to be covered. After the training, UC supervisors will receive the same quiz and the results of what they learned can be measured.

Level 3 – Behavior: Measure change in behavior post-training. UC can do this via performance evaluations including annual performance reviews or by implementing 360 reviews where staff are asked to evaluate their supervisors in several different areas. Positive feedback in the areas where training was implemented would be a good indicator of behavior measurement. This could also be done through surveys, as well as direct follow up with higher level supervisors.

Level 4 – Results: Measure the results of the training program to determine whether or not it was worth the cost and effort. This measurement could be difficult unless mandatory training is tied directly to UC goals. These can include indicators such as: staff retention, promotion, engagement, increased productivity, and reduced costs.

Conclusion

UC supervisors must be well trained in order to create a positive work environment that successfully recruits and retains top staff. The impact of ineffective supervisors has lasting pejorative effects on UC's mission. A shortage of well-trained supervisors will put UC at risk of losing valuable employees, particularly the younger generation that is just now entering the workforce. UC must have mandatory supervisor training on all campuses that is adequately funded in order to promote consistency across the UC system. Mandatory training needs to include basic skills for new to role supervisors as well as advanced skills for experienced supervisors. There needs to be a culture shift so that staff feel empowered to take training, as well as apply the skills learned in the everyday work place. Without these changes, UC will continue to have inadequate supervisory programs alongside excellent programs. These inconsistencies will continue to degrade our workforce. Additionally, we need to provide more incentives for staff to take the necessary time to receive this training. Staff (or our supervisors) feel it is too difficult to take a single day, or even a half-day or a few hours, to go to a training class, because too much work will pile up. Our cutbacks of the last 5 years have left us with little or no backup and staff are suffering because of it. Without a change in philosophy on the importance of training, we will be setting our supervisors up for failure. Mandatory supervisor training is just one small step to affect change at UC.

References

1. http://www.oeod.uci.edu/training.html

2. http://www.peaceminister.com/images/BTL_Article_UsingROI-to-MakeTheBusinessCaseForTraining.pdf

3. http://thebusinesstimes.com/the-big-bad-boss-poor-management-costly/

4. http://hbr.org/2008/11/supervisor-worklife-training-gets-results/ar/1

5. http://www.cnbc.com/id/47677957

6. http://businessjournal.gallup.com/content/106912/turning-around-your-turnover-problem.aspx

7. http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/labor/report/2012/11/16/44464/there-are-significant-business-costs-to-replacing-employees/

8. http://www.kirkpatrickpartners.com/